

ECO 2210Y

The Economic History of Later Medieval and Early Modern Europe

Topic No. 26: The 'Rise of the Gentry' Debate:

Agriculture and Social Structure in Tudor-Stuart England

Within each section, all readings are listed in the chronological order of original publication (when that can be ascertained), except for some collections of essays.

A. PRIMARY READINGS: on the Tawney-Stone-Trevor Roper Debate

- * 1. R.H. Tawney, The Agrarian Problem in the Sixteenth Century (London, 1912; reissued London and New York, 1967). Introduction to the 1967 edn. by Lawrence Stone. See Part I, chapter 1; Part II, chapter 1.
- ** 2. R.H. Tawney, 'The Rise of the Gentry, 1558-1640,' Economic History Review, 1st ser. 11 (1941). Reprinted with a postscript (1954) in E.M. Carus-Wilson, ed., Essays in Economic History, Vol. I (1954), pp. 173-214; and excerpts in Stone (1965).
- * 3. Lawrence Stone, 'The Anatomy of the Elizabethan Aristocracy,' Economic History Review, 1st ser. 18 (1948). Excerpts in Stone (1965).
- 4. H.R. Trevor-Roper, 'The Elizabethan Aristocracy: An Anatomy Anatomized,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 3 (1951), 279-98. A vigorous (indeed heartless) attack on Stone, reprinted in part in Stone (1965).
- 5. Lawrence Stone, 'The Elizabethan Aristocracy: A Restatement,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 4 (1952).
- ** 6. Hugh R. Trevor-Roper (Lord Dacre), The Gentry, 1540-1640: Economic History Review Supplement no. 1, (Cambridge University Press, 1953). Excerpt in Stone (1965).
- 7. P. Zagorin, 'The English Revolution, 1640-1660,' Cahiers d'histoire mondiale, 2 (1955).
- 8. Lawrence Stone, The Crisis of the Aristocracy, 1558-1641 (Oxford, 1956). Excerpts in Stone (1965).
- * 9. J.P. Cooper, 'The Counting of Manors,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 8 (1956), 377 - 86.

- * 10. Jack Hexter, 'Storm Over the Gentry,' Encounter, 10 (1958). Reprinted in J.H. Hexter, Reappraisals in History (London, 1961); and in Stone (1965).
- 11. P. Zagorin, 'The Social Interpretations of the English Revolution,' Journal of Economic History, 19 (1959). Excerpt in Stone (1965).
- * 12. Alan Simpson, The Wealth of the Gentry, 1540-1660 (Chicago, 1961).
- * 13. Julian Cornwall, 'The Early Tudor Gentry,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 17 (1965), 456 - 71.
- ** 14. Lawrence Stone, ed., Social Change and Revolution in England, 1540-1640, Problems & Perspectives Series (London, 1965):
 - (a) Part I: Excerpts of articles, essays etc. by Engels, Tawney, Trevor-Roper, Hexter, Zagorin, Hill, and Stone himself.
 - (b) Part II: Selected documents on Tudor-Stuart England relevant to the debate.
- * 15. Gordon Batho, 'Noblemen, Gentlemen, and Yeomen,' as chapter V, Part B, in Joan Thirsk, ed., The Agrarian History of England and Wales, Vol. IV: 1500-1640 (Cambridge, 1967), pp. 276-305.
- ** 16. George E. Mingay, The Gentry: The Rise and Fall of a Ruling Class (London, 1976), especially chapters 1 and 3.
- * 17. Robert Brenner, 'Agrarian Class Structure and Economic Development in Pre-Industrial Europe,' Past and Present, no. 70 (Feb. 1976), 30-75. Republished in Aston and Philipin (1987).
- * 18. J. P. Cooper, 'In Search of Agrarian Capitalism,' Past and Present, No. 80 (August 1978), 20-65. One of many attacks on Brenner (1976). Republished in Aston and Philipin (1987).
- * 19. Robert Brenner, 'The Agrarian Roots of European Capitalism,' Past and Present, No. 97 (Nov. 1982), 16-113. A rather lengthy reply to all of his critics, republished in Aston and Philipin (1987).
- 20. J. T. Cliffe, The Puritan Gentry (London, 1984).
- * 21. Christopher Clay, Economic Expansion and Social Change: England 1500-1700, Vol. I: People, Land, and Towns (1985), chapter 5, 'The Landlords,' pp. 142 - 64.
- 22. T. H. Aston and C.H.E. Philipin, eds., The Brenner Debate: Agrarian Class Structure and Economic Development in Pre-Industrial Europe (Cambridge, 1987). Collected essays on this debate, beginning and ending with Brenner's articles (1976-82).

23. J. T. Cliffe, Puritans in Conflict: The Puritan Gentry during and after the Civil Wars (London: Routledge, 1988).
24. Julian C. K. Cornwall, Wealth and Society in Early Sixteenth-Century England (London, 1988).

B. Other Studies on the Structure of Landholding and Related Topics in Tudor-Stuart England: up to the Restoration (1485 - 1660)

1. Sir Thomas Smith, De Republica Anglorum, ed. L. Alston (London, 1906).
2. J.E. Neale, The Elizabethan House of Commons (London, 1949).
- * 3. Eric Kerridge, 'The Movement of Rent, 1540-1640,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 6 (1953); reprinted in E.M. Carus-Wilson, ed., Essays in Economic History, Vol. II (London, 1962), pp. 208-26.
4. W.G. Hoskins, 'The Rebuilding of Rural England, 1570-1640,' Past and Present, no. 4 (1953).
5. Joan Thirsk, 'The Sales of Royalist Land During the Interregnum,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 5 (1954).
6. F.J. Fisher, 'The Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries: The Dark Ages in English Economic History?' Economica, new series, 24 (1957).
7. H.J. Habakkuk, 'The Market for Monastic Property, 1539-1603,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 10 (1958).
8. R.H. Tawney, Business and Politics Under James I (Cambridge, 1958).
9. Christopher Hill, The Century of Revolution, 1603-1714 (1961).
10. Roger Schofield, 'The Geographical Distribution of Wealth in England, 1334-1649,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 18 (1965). Reprinted in Roderick Floud, ed., Essays in Quantitative Economic History (Oxford, 1974), pp. 79-132.
11. Charles Wilson, England's Apprenticeship, 1603-1763 (London, 1965): Part I (1603-1660), chapters 1, 2, and 6.
- * 12. Peter Ramsey, Tudor Economic Problems (London, 1965), chapter I: 'Agrarian Problems,' pp. 19-46.
13. Christopher Hill, The Intellectual Origins of the English Revolution (Oxford, 1965).

14. Lawrence Stone, 'Social Mobility in England, 1500-1700,' and Alan Everitt, 'Social Mobility in Early Modern England,' both in: Past and Present, No. 33 (April 1966), pp. 16-55 and 56-73.
 15. J.P. Cooper, 'The Social Distribution of Land and Men in England, 1436-1700,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 20 (1967). Reprinted in Roderick Floud, ed., Essays in Quantitative Economic History (Oxford, 1974), pp. 79-132.
 16. Christopher Hill, Reformation to Industrial Revolution: Pelican Economic History of Britain, Vol. II: 1530-1780 (London, 1967), Part II, chapter 3; Part III, chapter 3.
 17. Eric Kerridge, Agrarian Problems in the Sixteenth Century and After (London, 1969). A rebuttal of Tawney's The Agrarian Problem of the Sixteenth Century, more concerned with the question of enclosure than with the gentry debate per se.
 18. Joyce Youings, The Dissolution of the Monasteries, Historical Problems series no. 14 (London, 1971). Introduction, and pp. 25-90, 117-34.
 19. M.E. James, 'The Concept of Order and the Northern Rising of 1569,' Past and Present, no. 60 (Aug. 1973), pp. 49-83.
 20. Ian Gentles, 'The Sales of Crown Lands during the English Revolution,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 26 (1973), 614-32.
 - * 21. A.R. Bridbury, 'Sixteenth-Century Farming,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 27 (1974), 538-56.
 22. Andrew Sharp, 'Edward Waterhouse's View of Social change in Seventeenth-Century England,' Past and Present, no. 62 (Feb. 1974), pp. 27-46.
- On this topic see: Edward Waterhouse, The Gentlemen's Monitor: Or a Sober Inspection into the Virtues, Vices, and Ordinary Means of the Rise and Decay of Men and Families (1665).
23. Andrew Appleby, 'Agrarian Capitalism or Seigneurial Reaction? The North West of England, 1500 - 1700,' American Historical Review, 80 (June 1975), 574-94.
 24. D. Thomas, 'Leases in Reversion on the Crown's Lands, 1558-1603,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 30 (1977), 67-72.
 - * 25. Donald Coleman, The Economy of England, 1450-1750 (Oxford, 1977): chapter 1 ('Economy and Social Order') and 3 ('Agriculture and Rural Society, 450-1650').
 26. G.E. Aylmer, 'Property' in Seventeenth-Century England,' Past and Present, no. 86 (Feb. 1980), 87-97.

- * 27. Christopher Clay, Economic Expansion and Social Change: England, 1500-1700, Vol. I: People, Lands, and Towns (London, 1985): chapter 5, 'The Landlords,' pp. 142-64.
25. Julian C. K. Cornwall, Wealth and Society in Early Sixteenth-Century England (London, 1988).
26. S. J. Gunn, 'Peers, Commons, and Gentry in the Lincolnshire Revolt of 1536,' Past & Present, no. 123 (May 1989), pp. 52 - 79.
27. R. W. Hoyle, 'Tenure and the Land Market in Early-Modern England: Or a Late Contribution to the Brenner Debate,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 43 (Feb. 1990), 1 - 20.
28. Marjorie Keniston McIntosh, A Community Transformed: The Manor and Liberty of Havering, 1500 - 1620 (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1991).
29. Govind Sreenivasan, 'The Land-Family Bond at Earls Colne (Essex), 1550 - 1650,' Past & Present, no. 131 (May 1991), 3 - 37.
30. Christine Carpenter, Locality and Polity: A Study of Warwickshire Landed Society, 1401 - 1499 (New York and Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992).
31. Ian Ward, 'Rental Policy on the Estates of the English Peerage, 1649 - 1660,' Agricultural History Review, 40:i (1992), 23 - 37.
32. R. W. Hoyle, 'Some Reservations on Dr. Ward on the 'Rental Policy of the English Peerage, 1649-60',' Agricultural History Review, 40:ii (1992), 156-59.
33. R. W. Hoyle, ed., The Estates of the English Crown, 1558 - 1640 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992).
34. Ian Ward, 'The Humble Response of the Hired Lackey: A Reply to Hoyle,' Agricultural History Review, 41:ii (1993), 176-78.
35. R. W. Hoyle, 'Further Comments on Dr Ward and the 'Rental Policy of the English Peerage, 1649-60',' Agricultural History Review, 41:ii (1993), 178-80.
36. Eric Acheson, A Gentry Community: Leicestershire in the Fifteenth Century, c.1422-c.1485 (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1993).
37. Daniel C. Quinlan and Jean A. Shackelford, 'Economy and English Families, 1500 - 1850,' Journal of Interdisciplinary History, 24:3 (Winter 1994), 431-63.
38. Felicity Heal and Clive Holmes, The Gentry in England and Wales, 1500 - 1700 (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1994).

39. Jennifer Ward, ed., Women of the English Nobility and Gentry, 1066-1500 (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 1995).
- * 40. P. R. Coss, 'The Formation of the English Gentry,' Past & Present, no. 147 (May 1995), pp. 38-64.
41. Govind Sreenivasan, 'The Land-Family Bond in England: Reply,' Past & Present, no. 146 (February 1995), pp. 174-87.

C. The Gentry and the Aristocracy in England, 1660-1760

- * 1. H.J. Habakkuk, 'English Landownership, 1680-1740,' Economic History Review, 1st ser. 10 (1940), 2-17. Should be read in conjunction with Tawney (1941, 1954) and Trevor Roper (1953) below.
2. H.J. Habakkuk, 'Economic Functions of Landowners in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries,' Explorations in Entrepreneurial History, 6 (1952).
3. H. J. Habakkuk, 'The Long Term Rate of Interest and the Price of Land in the Seventeenth Century,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 5 (1952), 26-
4. Joan Thirsk, 'The Restoration Land Settlement,' Journal of Modern History, 26 (1954).
5. H.J. Habakkuk, 'The English Land Market in the Eighteenth Century,' in J.S. Bromley and E. Kossman, eds., Britain and the Netherlands, I (London, 1960), 155-80.
6. George Mingay, English Landed Society in the Eighteenth Century (London, 1963), chapters 1-4.
7. H.J. Habakkuk, 'La disparition du paysan anglais,' Annales: Économies, sociétés, civilisations, 20 (1965), 649-63.
8. Charles Wilson, England's Apprenticeship, 1603-1763 (1965), Part II (1660-1700), chapter 7; Part II (1700-63), chapter 11, 16.
9. Peter Laslett, The World We Have Lost (1965), chapters 1 and 2.
10. F.M.L. Thompson, 'The Social Distribution of Landed Property in England since the Sixteenth Century,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 19 (1966), 505-17.
11. Christopher Clay, 'Marriage, Inheritance, and the Rise of Large Estates in England, 1660-1815,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 21 (1968), 503-18.
- * 12. George Mingay, Enclosure and the Small Farmer in the Age of the Industrial Revolution (London, 1968).
- * 13. B.A. Holderness, 'The English Land Market in the Eighteenth Century: The Case of

- Lincolnshire,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 27 (1974), 557-76. (An attack on Habbakuk).
14. Christopher Clay, 'The Price of Freehold Land in the Later Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser., 27 (1974).
 - * 15. George Mingay, The Gentry (London, 1976), chapters 4, 5, 6 (passim).
 16. J.V. Beckett, 'English Landownership in the Later Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries: The Debate and its Problems,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 30 (1977), 567-81. (Also an attack on Habbakuk).
 17. Lloyd Bonfield, 'Marriage Settlements and the 'Rise of Great Estates': The Demographic Aspect,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 32 (1979), 483-93.
 18. H.J. Habakkuk, 'The Rise and Fall of English Landed Families, 1600 - 1800,' Transactions of the Royal Historical Society, 29-31 (1979-81).
 19. G.E. Aylmer, ' 'Property' in Seventeenth-Century England,' Past and Present, no. 86 (Feb. 1980), 87-97.
 - * 20. Christopher Clay, Economic Expansion and Social Change: England, 1500-1700, Vol. I: People, Lands, and Towns (London, 1985), chapter 5, 'The Landlords,' pp. 142-64.
 21. Christopher Clay, 'Landlords and Estate Management in England,' in Joan Thirsk, ed., The Agrarian History of England and Wales, Vol. V: 1640-1750, part ii: Agrarian Change (Cambridge, 1985), pp. 119-251.
 22. C. E. Searle, 'Custom, Class Conflict, and Agrarian Capitalism: the Cumbrian Customary Economy in the Eighteenth Century,' Past and Present, no. 110 (Feb. 1986), 106-33.
 23. T. H. Aston and C.H.E. Philipin, eds., The Brenner Debate: Agrarian Class Structure and Economic Development in Pre-Industrial Europe (Cambridge, 1987). Collected essays on this debate, beginning and ending with Brenner's articles (1976-82).
 24. J. T. Cliffe, Puritans in Conflict: The Puritan Gentry during and after the Civil Wars (London: Routledge, 1988).
 25. R. C. Allen, 'The Price of Freehold Land and the Interest Rate in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 41 (Feb. 1988), 33-50.
 26. John Habakkuk, Marriage, Debt, and the Estates System: English Landownership, 1650 - 1950 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994).
 27. F.M.L. Thompson, ed., Landowners, Capitalists, and Entrepreneurs: Essays for Sir John Habakkuk (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994).

28. Alan Armstrong, ed., The Economy of Kent, 1640 - 1914 (Woodbridge: Boydell and Brewer/Kent County Council, 1995).
29. M.E. Turner, J.V. Beckett, and B. Afton, Agricultural Rent in England, 1690 - 1914 (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997).
- * 30. R. C. Allen, 'The Price of Freehold Land and the Interest Rate in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries,' Economic History Review, 2nd ser. 41 (Feb. 1988), 33-50.
31. Daniel C. Quinlan and Jean A. Shackelford, 'Economy and English Families, 1500 - 1850,' Journal of Interdisciplinary History, 24:3 (Winter 1994), 431-63.
32. John Habakkuk, Marriage, Debt, and the Estates System: English Landownership, 1650 - 1950 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994).
33. F.M.L. Thompson, ed., Landowners, Capitalists, and Entrepreneurs: Essays for Sir John Habakkuk (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994).
34. Govind Sreenivasan, 'The Land-Family Bond in England: Reply,' Past & Present, no. 146 (February 1995), pp. 174-87.
35. Alan Armstrong, ed., The Economy of Kent, 1640 - 1914 (Woodbridge: Boydell and Brewer/Kent County Council, 1995).
36. M.E. Turner, J.V. Beckett, and B. Afton, Agricultural Rent in England, 1690 - 1914 (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997).
37. Felicity Heal and Clive Holmes, The Gentry in England and Wales, 1500 - 1700 (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1994).

Social Rank and Status in Tudor Stuart England

PEERAGE

GENTRY

Greater Nobility: Lords, Ladies

Lesser Nobility: Gentleman

Who Sit in the HOUSE OF LORDS

Who May be elected to the HOUSE OF COMMONS

- | | |
|--|--|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Duke, Archbishop 2. Marquess, Marquise 3. Earl 4. Viscount 5. Baron, Bishop | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 6. Baronet (from 1611 only) (Sir) 7. Knight (Sir) 8. Esquire (Mr.) 9. Gentleman (Mr.) |
|--|--|

.....

Percentage of Lands Held by English Social Groupings

	<u>In 1436</u>	<u>In 1690</u>	<u>1790</u>
Church and Crown:	35%	10%	10%
Peerage (Aristocracy):	20%	18%	25%
Gentry:	25%	45%	50%
Yeomen Freeholders:	20%	27%	15%

Source:

George Mingay, The Gentry (London, 1976), p. 59, Table 3.1 (figures adjusted, to add up to 100%).

QUESTIONS

1. Who were the English 'gentry'? In what senses are they a unique social class or social grouping in Europe: in particular, a non-noble 'lesser nobility'? In what respects do they resemble the French seigneurs; in what critical respects do they differ? How are they related to, and how do they differ from, the English aristocracy? In what House of Parliament do the representatives of the English gentry sit?

N.B. Do not let this debate mislead you into thinking that the gentry are a 'new' social class in Tudor England. For the medieval gentry, see: Michael Postan, 'Medieval Agrarian Society in its Prime: England,' in Cambridge Economic History, Vol. I: Agrarian Life of the Middle Ages, 2nd edition revised by M.M. Postan (1966), pp. 592-599.

For a contemporary definition of the English gentry, see Sir Thomas Smith, De Republica Anglorum (ed. L. Alston, London, 1906).

2. Review and discuss the Tawney-Trevor Roper debate. Were the English gentry of Tudor-Stuart England 'rising' or 'falling'? Are Tawney and Trevor-Roper speaking in fact about the same groups of gentry, in the same areas of England, and in the same time periods? Can their views be at least partially reconciled? How do Stone's and Hexter's views (and those of Zagorin, Hill, etc.) fit into this debate: and with what success?
3. What relationship is there between Trevor-Roper's views in this debate about the English gentry and his thesis about the 'General Crisis of the Seventeenth Century'? See his article, with that title, in Trevor Aston, ed., Crisis in Europe, 1560-1660: Essays from Past and Present, pp. 59-96.
4. In more general terms, what relevance does the debate about the gentry have with the following?:
 - (a) The Price Revolution of the Sixteenth Century.
 - (b) The General Crisis of the Seventeenth Century.
 - (c) The Tudor-Stuart Enclosure Movement.
 - (d) The 'Rise of Capitalism'.
5. In particular, what was the economic significance (if any) of the English gentry for the economic development of Tudor-Stuart England? How do they compare with other English social classes/groupings (aristocracy, yeomanry, merchants, & other bourgeoisie, etc.) in: (a) enclosure of land for arable and/or pasture; (b) investments in rural and/or urban industries and trades. Did the gentry have 'a social predisposition to invest productively'—or a more marked predisposition to do so than the aristocracy?
6. What changes occurred in England landholding between 1500 and 1700 in terms of the following: aristocracy, the Church, the Crown, the gentry, the 'yeomanry' (and other peasant freeholders), the 'bourgeoisie' (merchants, lawyers, etc.)?
7. Did the English titled, landed aristocracy make a 'comeback' in the later 17th and 18th centuries (1660-1740)? Read Habbakuk, in particular, on this question: Part C, no. 1, et seq. In what respects

was the post- Restoration aristocracy a difference social class from that of the pre-Civil War era? How many of Tawney's 'gentry' had, by or after 1660, been elevated to the peerage? How does Habbakuk's thesis relate to the Tawney-Trevor Roper debate (and to the views of Lawrence Stone). And to the '17th-Century Crisis'?