

ECO 406 – Critical Review Grading Rubric

| Category | Excellent | Good | Competent | Problematic | Pts. |
|-----------------------------------|--|--|--|--|-------------|
| Introduction | <p>[4-5]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Grabs readers' attention. Sets up thesis statement. Gives <i>accurate</i> and <i>concise</i> representation of authors' main arguments. | <p>[3-4]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Thesis statement hard to identify. Gives <i>accurate</i> and <i>concise</i> representation of authors' main arguments. | <p>[2-3]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> No thesis statement. Gives mostly accurate representation of authors' main arguments. Includes some authors' arguments that are not addressed in the analysis. | <p>[0-2]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inaccurate representation of authors' main arguments. Too long and includes many authors' arguments not addressed in the analysis. | [5] |
| Critical Economic Analysis | <p>[25-30]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Critically analyzes authors' arguments using an economic framework. Pays attention to details of model, assumptions, predictions, etc. Correctly and effectively uses tools studied in class (or in other courses). Criticisms pick out important economic points and not minor aspects. Shows independent thinking rather than merely paraphrasing class materials. Uses evidence to refute/support arguments. | <p>[20-25]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Critically analyzes authors' arguments using an economic framework. Mostly pays attention to details of model, assumptions, predictions, etc. Correctly and effectively uses tools studied in class (or in other courses) with only minor errors. Focuses critical analysis on minor points such as writing style, minor inconsistencies or quality of authors' sources. <p><i>or</i></p> <p>Mostly paraphrases class materials with no evidence of independent thinking.</p> | <p>[15-20]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Attempts to translate the authors' arguments into an economic framework that uses tools studied in class (or in other courses). Uses class tools with significant conceptual errors. <p><i>or</i></p> <p>Does not show clearly that has identified and understood authors' arguments.</p> | <p>[0-15]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mostly summarizes articles. Makes minimal to no attempt to link articles' arguments to class tools or tools used with significant conceptual errors. | [30] |

| | | | | | |
|--------------------------|---|--|---|--|--------------------|
| <p>Exposition</p> | <p>[8-10]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Paragraphs well organized by thought. • Smooth transition between paragraphs. • Clear, easy to read sentences. • No unnecessary repetitions. • Economic terms and concepts clearly explained. • Sources are referenced and cited correctly. | <p>[7-8]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Paragraphs not always well organized by thoughts. • Mostly smooth transition between paragraphs. • Some long, confused sentences. • Some minor unnecessary repetition. • Some economic terms and concepts used without clear explanation. • Sources are referenced and cited correctly. | <p>[5-7]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Paragraphs organization needs work. • Some sentence/word problems making it difficult to understand reasoning. • Economic terms used frequently without attempt to explain them. • Sources are mostly referenced and cited correctly. • Lengthy quotations from article instead of a concise summary if needed. | <p>[0-5]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant sentence/word problems making it difficult to understand reasoning. • Not completely written in paragraphs (e.g., bullet points, equations, graphs). • Sources are referenced and cited incorrectly. | <p>[10]</p> |
| <p>Conclusion</p> | <p>[4-5]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summarizes the analysis briefly and accurately. | <p>[3-4]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attempts to summarize the analysis briefly and accurately. | <p>[2-3]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summarizes the analysis somehow accurately but not briefly. | <p>[0-2]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No proper conclusion (summary not attempted). | <p>[5]</p> |